

**Table 1. Trail At East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area Site (EI-5Man Site):  
MET CS 4 Rank Reliability of Different Types of Evidence Used to Verify Trail Location<sup>1</sup>**

| <b>Relevant Evidence:<sup>2</sup><br/>All the Relevant Written,<br/>Cartographic, Physical, and Artifact Evidence</b> |   | <b>Relative Reliability<br/>Ranking Of Evidence:<br/>1 - 8 (1 is the highest)<sup>1</sup></b> |          |          |          |          |          |          |          | <b>Documented (Doc.)<br/>Evidence<sup>3</sup></b> |                              |
|---|---|---|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|---|------------------------------|
| <b>Supporting Evidence<sup>4A&amp;4B</sup></b>  | <b>Conflicting Evidence<sup>5A&amp;5B</sup></b> | <b>1</b>  | <b>2</b> | <b>3</b> | <b>4</b> | <b>5</b> | <b>6</b> | <b>7</b> | <b>8</b> | <b>Support<sub>6A</sub></b>                       | <b>Conflict<sub>6B</sub></b> |
| 1. GLO Surveyors Located 1855 JA-3 & JA-4 <sup>7</sup>  |   | X   |          |          |          |          |          |          |          | Doc.  | NCE                          |
| 2. JA-4 1,200' N Of EI-5Man Site <sup>8</sup>   |   | X   |          |          |          |          |          |          |          | Doc.  | NCE                          |
| 3. 1855 GLO Survey Located Cairn 1,400' N of EI-5Man Site <sup>9</sup>  |   | X   |          |          |          |          |          |          |          | Doc.  | NCE                          |
| 4 1856 GLO Map Linear Conformity For JA-4 - JA-7 & EI-5Man Site <sup>10</sup>   |   |   | X        |          |          |          |          |          |          | Doc.  | NCE                          |
| 5. Linear Conformity of 1855 JA-H-2A & EI-5Man Site <sup>11</sup>   |   |   |          | X        |          |          |          |          |          | Doc.  | NCE                          |
| 6. 1895 JO CO Map Conformity 1855 JA-4 - JA-8 & 1856 GLO Map <sup>12</sup>  |   |   |          |          |          |          |          | X        |          | Doc.  | NCE                          |
| 7. 1895 JO CO Map Shows EI-5Man Site Route Location <sup>13</sup>   |   |   |          |          |          |          |          | X        |          | Doc.  | NCE                          |
| 8. GLO Surveyors Locate EI-5Man Site Route - General S/N <sup>14</sup>  |   |   | X        |          |          |          |          |          |          | Doc.  | NCE                          |
| 9. University of Oregon (UO) Artifact Trail Evidence <sup>15</sup>  |   |   |          | X        |          |          |          |          |          | Doc.  | NCE                          |

Table 1 - 1

|   |  |  |   |   |   |  |  |   |   |      |     |
|---|--|--|---|---|---|--|--|---|---|------|-----|
| 10. UO Evidence Linear Conformity: JA-H-2A & EI-5Man Site <sup>16</sup>                   |  |  |   |   |   |  |  |   | X | Doc. | NCE |
| 11. N/S Road Trace 150' N of JA-4 <sup>17</sup>   |  |  | X |   |   |  |  |   |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 12. Three East-West Ridge Line Analysis <sup>18</sup>                                     |  |  | X |   |   |  |  |   |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 13. 390 foot Swale N of JA-4 & S of Harris Creek <sup>19</sup>                            |  |  | X |   |   |  |  |   |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 14. 1856 GLO Map Identified EI-5Man Site Route Area <sup>20</sup>                         |  |  |   | X |   |  |  |   |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 15. 1856 GLO Map & Linear Conformity of JA-4 - JA-7 & EI-5Man Site <sup>21</sup>          |  |  |   | X |   |  |  |   |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 16. 1855 GLO Linear Conformity JA-H-2A & the EI-5Man Site <sup>22</sup>                   |  |  |   | X |   |  |  |   |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 17. Period 1855 - 1856 GLO survey & Map Similar To 1846 - 1883 <i>Trail</i> <sup>23</sup> |  |  |   |   |   |  |  | X |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 18. All Other Supporting Evidence <sup>24</sup>   |  |  |   |   |   |  |  | X |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 19A. Maps <sup>25</sup>   |  |  |   | X | X |  |  | X |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 19B. Map 1 <sup>26</sup>  |  |  |   |   |   |  |  | X |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 19C. Map 2 <sup>27</sup>  |  |  |   |   |   |  |  | X |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 19D. Map 8 <sup>28</sup>  |  |  |   | X |   |  |  |   |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 19E. Map 9 <sup>29</sup>  |  |  |   | X |   |  |  |   |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 19F. Map 10 <sup>30</sup>   |  |  |   | X |   |  |  |   |   | Doc. | NCE |

Table 1 - 2

|                                     |  |  |  |  |   |   |  |  |   |      |     |
|-------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|---|---|--|--|---|------|-----|
| 19G. Map 11 <sup>31</sup>           |  |  |  |  |   | X |  |  |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 19H. Map EI-5Man - 1 <sup>32</sup>  |  |  |  |  | X |   |  |  |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 19I. Map EI-5Man - 2 <sup>33</sup>  |  |  |  |  |   |   |  |  | X | Doc. | NCE |
| 19J. Map EI-5Man - 3 <sup>34</sup>  |  |  |  |  |   |   |  |  | X | Doc. | NCE |
| 19K. Map EI-5Man - 4a <sup>35</sup> |  |  |  |  |   |   |  |  | X | Doc. | NCE |
| 19L. Map EI-5Man - 4b <sup>36</sup> |  |  |  |  | X |   |  |  |   | Doc. | NCE |
| 19M. Map EI-5Man - 5 <sup>37</sup>  |  |  |  |  |   |   |  |  | X | Doc. | NCE |
| 19N. Map EI-5Man - 6 <sup>38</sup>  |  |  |  |  |   |   |  |  | X | Doc. | NCE |

**Footnotes:** Table 1. *Trail At East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area Site (EI-5Man Site): MET CS 4 Rank Reliability of Different Types of Evidence Used to Verify Trail Location* is part of the document entitled, *Non-surveyed Applegate Trail Site: East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area Met Verified*. **Draft May 10, 2015**

Walker, Mike, Member, HETC, HNAHS. Draft May 15, 2015. *Non-surveyed Applegate Trail Site: East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area Met Verified*. Hugo, OR.

See Table JA-13 Table 1. MET CS 4 Rank Reliability of Different Types of Evidence Used to Verify Trail Location, part of the document entitled, *Scientific & MET Manual Methods*, as another example of a ranking reliability of different types of evidence table.

Walker, Mike, Member, HETC; Education Chair, HNAHS. Draft July 4, 2012; Updated Draft May 3, 2015. *Scientific & MET Manual Methods*. Hugo, OR.

- 
1. MET CS 4. Rank Reliability of Different Types of Evidence Used to Verify Trail Location (Trail Mapping Committee, Office of National Trails Preservation & Oregon-California Trails Association. July 2002, 4th edition. *Mapping Emigrant Trails MET Manual*. Independence, MO; MET, pps. 5 - 8). JA-13 Table 1 is not analysis. It is a summary of the researchers’s interpretive opinions which are based on a separate researcher’s analysis.
  2. MET CS 1. Examine All the Relevant Written, Cartographic, Physical, and Artifact Evidence (MET, p. 5). Only one of the two “Relevant Evidence” columns (i.e., supporting an conflicting evidence) is to be filled out with identifier of the specific evidence. The labels of “supporting” and “conflicting” are the nomenclature of the prediction (Section III.B.4.). When a researcher arrives at the point of identifying a prediction the mutually supporting evidence for the prediction is the “supporting” evidence, and any opposing evidence is identified as “conflicting” evidence.
  3. MET CS 1. Document All the Relevant Written, Cartographic, Physical, and Artifact Evidence (MET, p. 5). If it is not documented, it does not have a rating

(i.e., it does not exist for review). Both of the “Documented Evidence” columns (i.e., supporting an conflicting evidence) need to be filled out.

4. Specific type of supporting evidence.

4A. Supporting evidence without conflicting evidence needs documentation. The following observation applies to 4A, 4B, 5A, and 5B. According to the MET, compliance requires supporting and any conflicting evidence documentation in both the “Documented Evidence” columns. In this case, the researchers promoting supporting and conflicting evidence are not in compliance with the requirement of analyzing the merit of the opposing researchers’ evidence.

4B. Supporting evidence with conflicting evidence also needs to document the confidence of the conflicting evidence (Footnote 6B). In this case, only one of the two “Documented Evidence” columns is documented, indicating a compliance failure with the MET.

5A. Conflicting evidence needs documentation.

5B. Conflicting evidence also needs to document confidence in the supporting evidence (i.e., Footnote 6A).

6A. Supporting evidence is documented.

6B. Conflicting evidence is documented. In the case of EI-5Man Site, there is no conflicting evidence (NCE), or not mutually supporting evidence (NMSE).

### **Supporting Evidence Footnotes**

7. Written eyewitness descriptions of credible GLO Surveyors Wells Lake and George Hyde (Appendix I) locating JA-3 & JA-4 (i.e., 1855 GLO Surveys).

8. JA-4, which is approximately 1,200’ north of the EI-5Man Site.

9. 1855 GLO bearing and distance survey locating the Harris cairn, approximately 1,400’ north of the EI-5Man Site.

10. Linear Conformity of 1855 Applegate Trail GLO Surveyed Sites JA-4 through JA-7 which are located on both sides of the EI-5Man Site on 1856 GLO surveyed map.

11. Linear Conformity of 1855 GLO Surveyed Harris Cabin Site (JA-H-2A) & EI-5Man Site.

12. 1895 Official Josephine County Map Shows Similar Locations For 1855 GLO Surveyed Sites JA-4 - JA-8 and 1856 GLO Surveyed Map.

13. 1895 Official County Map identifying route EI-5Man Site is located.

14. Written eyewitness descriptions of GLO Surveyors Wells Lake and George Hyde locating the EI-5Man Site as part of a general south-north general way, or direction.

15. Physical and Artifact Evidence From University of Oregon Studies Along Applegate Trail Around JA-H-2A Harris Cabin Site support Location of Trail.

16. From University of Oregon Studies support linear conformity JA-4, JA-H-2A, and EI-5Man Site.

17. A benched road trace, with a north-south orientation approximately 150’ north of JA-4.

18. The Three East-West Ridge Line Analysis.

19. A 390 foot swale north of JA-4 and south of Harris Creek.

20. 1856 GLO survey map cartographic evidence for EI-5Man Site route area inside of sections lines.

21. 1855 General Land Office (GLO) cadastral survey plats identifying the linear conformity of the *Trail* at Surveyed Sites JA-4 - JA-7, on both sides of EI-5Man Site

22. Linear conformity of 1855 GLO Surveyed Harris Cabin Site (JA-H-2A) & the EI-5Man Site.

23. The 1855 - 1856 GLO surveys and cartographic evidence being close in time to the 1846 - 1883 Applegate Trail

24. All other supporting evidence.

25. Maps

26. Map 1. Takelma Lands In Southwestern Oregon

27. Map 2. Takelma Indians

28. Map 8. Hugo’s Indian Trail: 1855

29. Map 9. Hugo’s Applegate Trails: Map II of IV

30. Map 10. Hugo's Applegate Trails: Map III of IV
31. Map 11. Jacksonville Road (JR) Of Applegate Trail Over Harris Creek: 1856 - JR Ford No. 4: Harris Creek
32. Map EI-5Man - 1. 1855 Applegate Trail GLO Surveyed Sites JA-4 - JA-8 & Non-Surveyed Applegate Trail Site: East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area
33. Map EI-5Man - 2. 1855 Applegate Trail GLO Surveyed Site JA-3 & Non-Surveyed Applegate Trail Site: East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area
34. Map EI-5Man - 3. 1855 Applegate Trail GLO Surveyed Sites JA-4 - JA-5 & Non-Surveyed Applegate Trail Site: East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area
35. Map EI-5Man - 4a. 1855 Applegate Trail GLO Surveyed Sites JA-4 - JA-5 & JA-H-2A & Non-Surveyed Applegate Trail Site: East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area
36. Map EI-5Man - 4b. Three East-West Ridges Along Jacksonville Road (JR) Of 1855 Applegate Trail
37. Map EI-5Man - 5. Early Settlers Along Quarry Section Of Applegate Trail
38. Map EI-5Man - 6. 1895 Sections 13, 14, 23, & 24, T.35S., R.6W., Flanagan Ranch

**Non-Supporting Evidence Footnotes**

In the case of EI-5Man Site, there is no conflicting evidence (NCE), or not mutually supporting evidence (NMSE).

The following three related documents are publicly available for review and comments at Hugo's web page.

1. Table 1. *Trail At East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area Site (EI-5Man Site): MET CS 4 Rank Reliability of Different Types of Evidence Used to Verify Trail Location*  
(For *Non-surveyed Applegate Trail Site: East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area Met Verified*)
2. *Maps For Non-surveyed Applegate Trail Site: East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area Met Verified*
3. *Analysis Paper: Non-surveyed Applegate Trail Site: East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area Met Verified*  
(Walker, Mike, Member, HETC. Very Draft May 10, 2015. *Non-surveyed Applegate Trail Site: East I-5 Manzanita Rest Area Met Verified*. Hugo, OR)

Applegate Trail Inventory  
Educational Resources  
Hugo Neighborhood Association & Historical Society  
[http://www.hugoneighborhood.org/miscellaneous\\_research\\_papers\\_and\\_documents.htm](http://www.hugoneighborhood.org/miscellaneous_research_papers_and_documents.htm)